

The Honorable Marsha J. Pechman

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
AT SEATTLE

ARMEN BEEMAN,

Plaintiff,

v.

ALEJANDRO MAYORKAS, in his official
capacity as Secretary of the U.S. Department of
Homeland Security,

Defendant.

Case No. 2:21-cv-00235-MJP

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER

**Noted for Consideration:
November 4, 2021**

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection may be warranted. The government anticipates that documents pertaining to individuals in a “system of records,” as defined by the Privacy Act, 5 U.S.C. § 552a(a)(5) (the “Privacy Act”), disclosure of which would potentially constitute a violation of criminal and civil law under § 552a(b) of the Privacy Act, absent an Order from this Court pursuant to § 552a(b)(11) of the Privacy Act, may need to be released and/or disclosed in discovery for the purpose of litigating this case. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with LCR 26(c). It does not confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under

1 the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively entitle parties to file confidential
2 information under seal.

3 2. “CONFIDENTIAL” MATERIAL

4 “Confidential” material shall include the following documents and tangible things
5 produced or otherwise exchanged:

- 6 • Any person’s financial records, including tax returns;
- 7 • Medical records and medical information;
- 8 • Personnel and employment-related records of any current or former government
9 employee;
- 10 • Documents related to any other current or former government employee’s
11 protected activity;
- 12 • Law enforcement sensitive information; and
- 13 • Any other records whose release without a protective order would potentially
14 violate the Privacy Act, 5 U.S.C. § 552a.

15 3. SCOPE

16 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only confidential material (as
17 defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential material; (2)
18 all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3) any testimony,
19 conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal confidential material.

20 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in
21 the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise.

22 4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

23 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed
24 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
25 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to
26 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential
27 material must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner

1 that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

2 4.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise
3 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may
4 disclose any confidential material only to:

5 (a) the receiving party's counsel of record in this action, as well as employees
6 of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

7 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in house counsel) of the
8 receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties
9 agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney's Eyes Only and is so
10 designated;

11 (c) experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for
12 this litigation and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit
13 A);

14 (d) the court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

15 (e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication
16 of confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service
17 instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately
18 return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

19 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
20 reasonably necessary and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound"
21 (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or ordered by the court. Pages of
22 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must
23 be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted
24 under this agreement;

25 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
26 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

1 4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or
 2 referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party,
 3 in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will
 4 remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion
 5 to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the
 6 designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue,
 7 and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to
 8 sealing the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be
 9 followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to
 10 file material under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must
 11 satisfy the requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion
 12 to seal. Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in
 13 accordance with the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

14 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

15 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party
 16 or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take
 17 care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate
 18 standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material,
 19 documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the
 20 material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not
 21 swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.

22 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
 23 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to
 24 unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary
 25 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

26 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated
 27 for protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other

1 parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

2 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
3 agreement (see, *e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or
4 ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must
5 be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

6 (a) Information in documentary form: (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents
7 and deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
8 proceedings), the designating party must affix the word “CONFIDENTIAL” to each page that
9 contains confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for
10 protection, the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by making
11 appropriate markings in the margins).

12 (b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties
13 and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other
14 pretrial proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other
15 testimony after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after
16 receiving the transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the
17 transcript, or exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect
18 confidential information at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

19 (c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place
20 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word
21 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection,
22 the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

23 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
24 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party’s
25 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a
26 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is treated
27 in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

1 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

2 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of
3 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality
4 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
5 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to
6 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
7 original designation is disclosed.

8 6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute
9 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding
10 confidential designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or
11 in a declaration or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good faith meet and confer
12 conference with other affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The
13 certification must list the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good faith effort to
14 confer requires a face-to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

15 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
16 intervention, the designating party may file and serve a motion to retain confidentiality under
17 Local Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if applicable). The burden of
18 persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party. Frivolous challenges, and those
19 made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on
20 other parties) may expose the challenging party to sanctions. All parties shall continue to
21 maintain the material in question as confidential until the court rules on the challenge.

22 7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
23 OTHER LITIGATION

24 If a party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels
25 disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that party
26 must:
27

1 (a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the
2 subpoena or court order;

3 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
4 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is
5 subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

6 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
7 by the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

8 8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

9 If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential
10 material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving
11 party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized
12 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material,
13 (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of
14 this agreement, and (d) request that such person or persons execute the “Acknowledgment and
15 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

16 9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE 17 PROTECTED MATERIAL

18 When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently
19 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the
20 receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This
21 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery
22 order or agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties agree
23 to the entry of a non-waiver order under Fed. R. Evid. 502(d) as set forth herein.

24 10. NON TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS

25 Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving
26 party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts
27 and summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of

1 destruction.

2 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all
3 documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence,
4 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
5 work product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

6 The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a
7 designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

8 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

9 DATED: November 4, 2021

/s/ Nolan Lim

NOLAN LIM LAW FIRM
Nolan Lim, WSBA No. 36830
Nolan Lim Law Firm
1111 Third Avenue, Suite 1850
Seattle, WA 98101
Phone: (206) 774-8874
nolanlim@nolanlimlaw.com
Attorney for Plaintiff

/s/ Mark Davis

Mark Davis, WSBA No. 38713
DETHLEFS SPARWASSER REICH
DICKERSON, PLLC
100 Second Avenue S., Suite 190
Edmonds, WA 98020
Phone: (425) 776-1352
Fax: (425) 776-2467
mark@detsparlaw.com
Attorney for Plaintiff

1 DATED: November 4, 2021

NICHOLAS W. BROWN
United States Attorney

2 /s/ Heather C. Costanzo
3 HEATHER C. COSTANZO, FL No. 37378
4 JAMES C. STRONG, OR No. 131597
5 Assistant United States Attorney
6 United States Attorney's Office
7 700 Stewart Street, Suite 5220
8 Seattle, Washington 98101-1271
9 Phone: 206-553-7970
10 Fax: 206-553-4067
11 Email: heather.costanzo@usdoj.gov
12 Email: james.strong@usdoj.gov
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27

ORDER

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that pursuant to Fed. R. Evid. 502(d), the production of any documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or any other federal or state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege applicable to those documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product protection, or any other privilege or protection recognized by law.

DATED: November 12, 2021



Marsha J. Pechman
United States Senior District Judge